

1  
2  
3  
4 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
5 **CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**  
6

7  
8 DAVID SCOTT RILEY, an individual;  
9 and NOVARIS COMMUNICATIONS ,  
10 INC., a Nevada corporation,

11 Plaintiffs,

12 v.

13 NEUL CAPITAL HOLDINGS, LLC, a  
14 Delaware limited liability company;  
15 FIOS SYSTEMS, LLC, a Delaware  
16 limited liability company; and DOES 1  
TO 50,

17 Defendants.

18 

---

NEUL CAPITAL HOLDINGS, LLC, a  
19 Delaware limited liability company; and  
20 FIOS SYSTEMS, LLC, a Delaware  
21 limited liability company,

22 Counterclaimants,

23 v.

24 DAVID SCOTT RILEY, an individual;  
25 and NOVARIS COMMUNICATIONS,  
26 INC., a Nevada corporation,

27 

---

Counterdefendants.  
28

Case No. 8:23-CV-01751 DOC(KESx)

**STIPULATED PROTECTIVE  
ORDER**

1           1.     A. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

2           As the parties have represented that discovery in this action is likely to  
3 involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which  
4 special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than  
5 prosecuting this litigation may be warranted, this Court enters the following  
6 Protective Order. This Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures  
7 or responses to discovery. The protection it affords from public disclosure and use  
8 extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential  
9 treatment under the applicable legal principles. Further, as set forth in Section 12.3,  
10 below, this Protective Order does not entitle the parties to file confidential  
11 information under seal. Rather, when the parties seek permission from the court to  
12 file material under seal, the parties must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5 and  
13 with any pertinent orders of the assigned District Judge and Magistrate Judge.

14           B. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

15           In light of the nature of the claims and allegations in this case and the parties'  
16 representations that discovery in this case will involve the production of confidential  
17 records, and in order to expedite the flow of information, to facilitate the prompt  
18 resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery materials, to adequately  
19 protect information the parties are entitled to keep confidential, to ensure that the  
20 parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such material in connection with  
21 this action, to address their handling of such material at the end of the litigation, and  
22 to serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such information is justified in this  
23 matter. The parties shall not designate any information/documents as confidential  
24 without a good faith belief that such information/documents have been maintained  
25 in a confidential, non-public manner, and that there is good cause or a compelling  
26 reason why it should not be part of the public record of this case.

27           2.     DEFINITIONS

28           2.1    Action: This pending federal lawsuit.

1           2.2    Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the  
2 designation of information or items under this Order.

3           2.3    “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of  
4 how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for  
5 protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in  
6 the Good Cause Statement.

7           2.4    “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL -- ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY”  
8 Information or Items: extremely sensitive “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or  
9 Items, the disclosure of which to another Party or Non-Party would create a  
10 substantial risk of serious harm that could not be avoided by less restrictive means.

11          2.5    Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as  
12 their support staff).

13          2.6    Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or  
14 items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as  
15 “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL -- ATTORNEYS’ EYES  
16 ONLY.”

17          2.7    Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless  
18 of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including,  
19 among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or  
20 generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

21          2.8    Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter  
22 pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as  
23 an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

24          2.9    House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action.  
25 House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside  
26 counsel.

27          2.10 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or  
28 other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

1           2.11 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a  
2 party to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and  
3 have appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm  
4 which has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

5           2.12 Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,  
6 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their  
7 support staffs).

8           2.13 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or  
9 Discovery Material in this Action.

10          2.14 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation  
11 support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or  
12 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)  
13 and their employees and subcontractors.

14          2.15 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is  
15 designated as “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL --  
16 ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY.”

17          2.16 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery  
18 Material from a Producing Party.

19          3.     SCOPE

20          The protections conferred by this Order cover not only Protected Material (as  
21 defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected  
22 Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material;  
23 and (3) any deposition testimony, conversations, or presentations by Parties or their  
24 Counsel that might reveal Protected Material, other than during a court hearing or at  
25 trial.

26          Any use of Protected Material during a court hearing or at trial shall be  
27 governed by the orders of the presiding judge. This Order does not govern the use  
28 of Protected Material during a court hearing or at trial.

1           4.     DURATION

2           Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations  
3 imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees  
4 otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be  
5 deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this Action, with  
6 or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and  
7 exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this Action,  
8 including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time  
9 pursuant to applicable law.

10          5.     DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

11          5.1    Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.

12       Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under  
13 this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that  
14 qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for  
15 protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written  
16 communications that qualify so that other portions of the material, documents,  
17 items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept  
18 unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

19       Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations  
20 that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper  
21 purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose  
22 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating  
23 Party to sanctions.

24       If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it  
25 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must  
26 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

27          5.2    Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in  
28 this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of Section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise

1 stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection  
2 under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or  
3 produced.

4 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

5 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic  
6 documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions), that the Producing Party affix  
7 at a minimum, the legend “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL --  
8 ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY” to each page that contains protected material. If  
9 only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the  
10 Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making  
11 appropriate markings in the margins).

12 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection  
13 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated  
14 which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and  
15 before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be  
16 deemed “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the inspecting Party has identified the  
17 documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which  
18 documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then,  
19 before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the  
20 “CONFIDENTIAL”, or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL -- ATTORNEYS’ EYES  
21 ONLY” legend to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or  
22 portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also  
23 must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings  
24 in the margins).

25 (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party identifies  
26 on the record, before the close of the deposition as protected testimony or within 10  
27 business days of the testimony being given. If the Designating Party identifies the  
28 testimony in the 10 business days after the testimony is given it shall be the

1 responsibility of the Designating Party to communicate the same to the court  
2 reporter.

3 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and  
4 for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on  
5 the exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the  
6 legend “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL -- ATTORNEYS’  
7 EYES ONLY.” If only a portion or portions of the information warrants protection,  
8 the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

9 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent  
10 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive  
11 the Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such material.  
12 Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable  
13 efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this  
14 Order.

15 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

16 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a  
17 designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court’s  
18 Scheduling Order.

19 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute  
20 resolution process under Local Rule 37-1 et seq.

21 6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on  
22 the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper  
23 purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other  
24 parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating  
25 Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall  
26 continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is  
27 entitled under the Producing Party’s designation until the Court rules on the  
28 challenge.

1           7.     ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

2           7.1    Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is  
3 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this  
4 Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such  
5 Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the  
6 conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a  
7 Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of Section 13 below.

8           Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a  
9 location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons  
10 authorized under this Order.

11          7.2    Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless  
12 otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a  
13 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated  
14 “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

15               (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as  
16 well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably  
17 necessary to disclose the information for this Action;

18               (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of  
19 the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action;

20               (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom  
21 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the  
22 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

23               (d) the court and its personnel;

24               (e) private court reporters and their staff to whom disclosure is reasonably  
25 necessary for this Action and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and  
26 Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

27               (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional  
28 Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have



1 signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

2 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a  
3 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

4 (h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the  
5 Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing party  
6 requests that the witness sign the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound”  
7 (Exhibit A); and (2) they will not be permitted to keep any confidential information  
8 unless they sign the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A),  
9 unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of  
10 transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected  
11 Material may be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to  
12 anyone except as permitted under this Protective Order; and

13 (i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel,  
14 mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

15 7.3 Disclosure of “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL -- ATTORNEYS’ EYES  
16 ONLY” Information or Items. Unless otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in  
17 writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any information or  
18 item designated “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

19 (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as well  
20 as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary  
21 to disclose the information for this Action;

22 (b) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom  
23 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the  
24 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

25 (c) the court and its personnel;

26 (d) private court reporters and their staff to whom disclosure is reasonably  
27 necessary for this Action and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and  
28 Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

(e) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

(f) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information; and

(g) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel, mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED  
PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION

If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL -- ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY,” that Party must:

(a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order unless prohibited by law;

(b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Protective Order; and

(c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL -- ATTORNEYS’ EYES ONLY” before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s permission, or unless otherwise required by the law or court order. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential

1 material and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or  
2 encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action to disobey a lawful directive from  
3 another court.

4 9. A NON-PARTY'S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE  
5 PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION

6 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a  
7 Non-Party in this Action and designated as "CONFIDENTIAL" or "HIGHLY  
8 CONFIDENTIAL -- ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY." Such information produced by  
9 Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief  
10 provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be construed as  
11 prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

12 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to  
13 produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is  
14 subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's  
15 confidential information, then the Party shall:

16 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party  
17 that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality  
18 agreement with a Non-Party;

19 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Protective  
20 Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific  
21 description of the information requested; and

22 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the  
23 Non-Party, if requested.

24 (c) If a Non-Party represented by counsel fails to commence the process  
25 called for by Local Rules 45-1 and 37-1, et seq. within 14 days of receiving the  
26 notice and accompanying information or fails contemporaneously to notify the  
27 Receiving Party that it has done so, the Receiving Party may produce the Non-  
28 Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If an

unrepresented Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court unless otherwise required by the law or court order. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A).

11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED MATERIAL

When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work

1 product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement into this Protective  
2 Order.

3 12. MISCELLANEOUS

4 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any  
5 person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

6 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. No Party waives any right it  
7 otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any information or item  
8 on any ground not addressed in this Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives  
9 any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered  
10 by this Protective Order.

11 12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any  
12 Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5 and with any pertinent  
13 orders of the assigned District Judge and Magistrate Judge. Protected Material may  
14 only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the  
15 specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material  
16 under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information  
17 in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

18 13. FINAL DISPOSITION

19 After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in Section 4, within 60  
20 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return  
21 all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in  
22 this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations,  
23 summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected  
24 Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving  
25 Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same  
26 person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies  
27 (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or  
28 destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies,

1 abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any  
 2 of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to  
 3 retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing  
 4 transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert  
 5 reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such  
 6 materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or  
 7 constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in  
 8 Section 4.

9 14. Any violation of this Order may be punished by any and all appropriate  
 10 measures including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary  
 11 sanctions.

12 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

13 DATED: June 28, 2024 GORDON REES SCULLY MANSUKHANI, LLP

14  
 15 By: /s/ Christopher B. Queally  
 16 Christopher B. Queally  
 Attorneys for  
 Plaintiffs/Counterdefendants

17 DATED: June 28, 2024 MUNDELL, ODLUM & HAWS, LLP

18  
 19 By: /s/ James A. Odum  
 20 James A. Odum  
 Attorneys for  
 Defendants/Counterclaimants

21  
 22 FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.

23  
 24 DATED: July 1, 2024

25 Karen E. Scott  
 Honorable Karen E. Scott  
 United States District/Magistrate Judge

EXHIBIT AACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full name], of  
 \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that  
 I have read in its entirety and understand the Protective Order that was issued by the  
 United States District Court for the Central District of California on  
 \_\_\_\_\_ in the case of  
 \_\_\_\_\_. I agree to comply with and to be  
 bound by all the terms of this Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that  
 failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of  
 contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information  
 or item that is subject to this Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict  
 compliance with the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court  
 for the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this  
 Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this  
 action. I hereby appoint \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full name] of  
 \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full address and  
 telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in connection with  
 this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this Protective Order.

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

City and State where sworn and signed: \_\_\_\_\_

Printed name: \_\_\_\_\_

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_